

## STATE OF NEW JERSEY

## FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matters of Rene Cicchetti and Brunilda Rodriguez, Assistant Chief of Administrative Services (C0845A), Hudson County

**Examination Appeals** 

CSC Docket Nos. 2020-2305 and 2020-2320

**ISSUED:** MAY 22, 2020 (SLK)

Rene Cicchetti and Brunilda Rodriquez appeal the determinations of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) that they did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Assistant Chief of Administrative Services (C0845A), Hudson County. These appeals have been consolidated due to common issues presented.

The education requirements were a Bachelor's degree. The experience requirements were two years of administrative experience in either analyzing, evaluating, and providing advice to management on such matters as work methods and procedures, communications, management information systems, organizational structure, manpower utilization, distribution of work assignments, delegation of authority, policy development, budget preparation, records management or similar areas, with the objective of improving managerial effectiveness or two years of administrative experience in managing, administering, or directing an organizational unit and its work program which entailed responsibility for planning, organizing, directing, staffing, coordinating, and budgeting for the activities of the unit. Applicants who did not meet the above educational requirements could substitute additional experience as described on a year for year basis. The requirements needed to be met by the September 4, 2019 closing date. A total of nine individuals applied for the subject examination and three were deemed eligible. Certification OL200214 was issued and its disposition is due May 26, 2020. The list expires on February 19, 2023.

On her application, Cicchetti did not indicate that she possessed any college credits. She did indicate that she was provisionally serving in the subject title from October 2016 to the September 4, 2019 closing date, a Secretarial Assistant from March 2014 to October 2016, an Assistant Treasurer for North Jersey Community Bank from September 2007 to April 2013 and an Administrator for BCB Community Bank from November 2000 to September 2007. Agency Services did not credit her with any experience, and, per the substitution clause, determined that she lacked six years of experience.

On her application, Rodriguez indicated that she possessed 22 college credits. She also indicated that she was a Clerk 1 from August 2017 to the September 4, 2019 closing date and a Dental Assistant/Administrator for Davis, Saltzberg & Wagner Dental Associates from 1999 to 2016. Agency Services credited her with two years and 10 months of experience based on her college credits and her experience as a Clerk 1, but determined that she lacked three years and two months of the required experience.

On appeal, Cicchetti presents that she is a professional administrator with over 20 years of analyzing, managing, policy development and records management experience. She presents that she has over three years of experience working in the subject title and believes that based on this experience alone, she should be eligible for the subject title.

Rodriguez presents that she has over 18 years of handling administrative duties which includes performing the required duties.

## CONCLUSION

*N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.3(b)2 provides, in pertinent part, that applicants for promotional examinations shall meet all requirements contained in the announcement by the announced closing date. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-6.3(b) provides, in pertinent part, that the appellant shall have the burden of proof.

In this matter, Agency Services correctly determined that the appellants were not eligible for the subject examination. Concerning Cicchetti, a review of her application indicates that her primary focus while serving provisionally in the subject title is administrative support and not providing advice to management with the objective of improving managerial effectiveness or directing an organizational unit and its work program. For experience to be considered applicable, it must have as its primary focus full-time responsibilities in the areas required in the announcement. See In the Matter of Bashkim Vlashi (MSB, decided June 9, 2004). Moreover, per the substitution clause, Cicchetti needs six years of the required experience. Therefore, even if she received credit for her provisional experience, she would still be

approximately three years short of the required experience by the closing date as her primary duties as a Secretarial Assistant, Assistant Treasurer or Administrator involved either secretarial and other support duties, financial duties, or loan closings and her primary focus in these positions was not in the required areas. Additionally, as the record does indicate that Cicchetti is primarily performing the duties of the subject title, the Civil Service Commission (Commission) finds that appellant's position classification be referred to Agency Services for review.

In reference to Rodriquez, she did receive two years and 10 months of credit for her college credits and her experience as a Clerk 1. However, per the substitution clause, Agency Service correctly determined that she lacked three years and two months of experience as her experience as a Dental Assistant/Administrator did not primarily involve providing advice to improve managerial effectiveness nor was she directing an organizational unit and its work program as her primary duties. Rather, this position involved customer service, processing payments and managing supplies and inventory.

## **ORDER**

Therefore, it is ordered that the appeals be denied, and the classification of Rene Cicchetti's provisional position classification be referred to Agency Services for review.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE  $20^{\mathrm{TH}}$  DAY OF MAY, 2020

Derdre' L. Webster Calib

Deirdre L. Webster Cobb

Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries and Correspondence Christopher S. Myers

Director

Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs Civil Service Commission Written Record Appeals Unit

P.O. Box 312

Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Rene Cicchetti (2020-2305)
Brunilda Rodriquez (2020-2320)
Elinor Gibney
Kelly Glenn
Records Center